

WEBVTT

1 00:00:00.220 --> 00:00:04.400 <v ->Economic expansion. All sorts of areas</v>
2 00:00:04.400 --> 00:00:07.380 of human consumption and travel
3 00:00:07.380 --> 00:00:12.180 and resource use increasing very significantly.
4 00:00:12.180 --> 00:00:15.080 And this has had a significant effect
5 00:00:15.080 --> 00:00:17.110 on greenhouse gas emissions,
6 00:00:17.110 --> 00:00:19.523 particularly over the past 70 years.
7 00:00:20.400 --> 00:00:22.180 So I like this chart
8 00:00:22.180 --> 00:00:27.180 which shows global primary energy consumption since 1800.
9 00:00:27.780 --> 00:00:29.890 And you can see historically humans
10 00:00:29.890 --> 00:00:34.470 typically relied on traditional biogas, wood, cow dung,
11 00:00:34.470 --> 00:00:37.840 resources directly available for energy production
12 00:00:37.840 --> 00:00:42.840 and we've had this shift over the past century plus toward
13 00:00:43.380 --> 00:00:45.550 particularly fossil fuels.
14 00:00:45.550 --> 00:00:49.030 But what I think is interesting is that even as
15 00:00:49.030 --> 00:00:53.660 we've had rapid developments of technologies for green
16 00:00:53.660 --> 00:00:55.810 and sustainable energy use,
17 00:00:55.810 --> 00:01:00.077 we haven't seen the shift in our actual consumption relying
18 00:01:01.260 --> 00:01:02.930 on those as primary sources of energy.
19 00:01:02.930 --> 00:01:07.010 We're still very dependent on the early sources of energy
20 00:01:07.010 --> 00:01:11.560 from the industrial revolution with coal, oil, and then
21 00:01:11.560 --> 00:01:14.663 we've had the more recent development of natural gas.
22 00:01:15.570 --> 00:01:18.110 But we can see that we have a long way to go

23 00:01:18.110 --> 00:01:23.110 in terms of shifting toward energy that will be sustainable.

24 00:01:24.960 --> 00:01:29.740 So thinking about the scenario that has resulted

25 00:01:29.740 --> 00:01:33.010 from greenhouse gas consumption,

26 00:01:33.010 --> 00:01:36.790 climate change is contributing to desertification,

27 00:01:36.790 --> 00:01:41.100 sea level rise, resource scarcity, and increased frequency

28 00:01:41.100 --> 00:01:43.230 of extreme weather events particularly

29 00:01:43.230 --> 00:01:47.110 in low latitude areas forcing people from their homes.

30 00:01:47.110 --> 00:01:50.930 In 2020, weather related hazards such as storms

31 00:01:50.930 --> 00:01:55.243 and floods triggered 30.1 million displacement worldwide.

32 00:01:56.570 --> 00:01:59.810 The sea level is rising 12 millimeters a year

33 00:01:59.810 --> 00:02:01.300 in the western Pacific

34 00:02:01.300 --> 00:02:03.850 and has already submerged eight islands.

35 00:02:03.850 --> 00:02:08.010 By 2100 is estimated that 48 islands will be lost

36 00:02:08.010 --> 00:02:09.670 to the rising ocean.

37 00:02:09.670 --> 00:02:13.290 Countries such as Tuvalu, Kiribati and the Marshall Islands

38 00:02:13.290 --> 00:02:16.350 already experience ocean flooding that washes salt water

39 00:02:16.350 --> 00:02:17.740 onto agricultural lands

40 00:02:17.740 --> 00:02:20.150 and inundates drinking water sources.

41 00:02:20.150 --> 00:02:22.650 So it's quite likely that some islands

42 00:02:22.650 --> 00:02:26.213 will lose fresh water long before land is lost.

43 00:02:28.220 --> 00:02:31.790 Vulnerable communities are experiencing forced migration

44 00:02:31.790 --> 00:02:33.640 already throughout the world.

45 00:02:33.640 --> 00:02:34.860 So Pacific islands

46 00:02:34.860 --> 00:02:37.740 are having coastal erosion forcing residents

47 00:02:37.740 --> 00:02:41.450 to leave displacement in Asian countries is occurring
 48 00:02:41.450 --> 00:02:44.240 due to severe storms.
 49 00:02:44.240 --> 00:02:46.410 Climate impacts on rural livelihoods
 50 00:02:46.410 --> 00:02:48.870 are forcing central agents to migrate
 51 00:02:48.870 --> 00:02:51.470 to urban areas for survival.
 52 00:02:51.470 --> 00:02:54.110 Less African coastal fishing villages are leaving
 53 00:02:54.110 --> 00:02:56.500 due to the depletion of fish resources caused
 54 00:02:56.500 --> 00:03:01.113 by ocean acidification as you see in this image here.
 55 00:03:02.090 --> 00:03:05.120 Latin American droughts are forcing both internal
 56 00:03:05.120 --> 00:03:07.463 and international migration.
 57 00:03:09.149 --> 00:03:12.677 And the future of climate migration is looking
 58 00:03:13.730 --> 00:03:15.380 to expand significantly.
 59 00:03:15.380 --> 00:03:18.560 So the world bank estimates that three regions,
 60 00:03:18.560 --> 00:03:22.420 Latin America, sub-Saharan Africa and South-east Asia
 61 00:03:22.420 --> 00:03:26.040 will generate 143 million more climate migrants
 62 00:03:26.040 --> 00:03:27.503 by the year 2050.
 63 00:03:30.450 --> 00:03:31.283 This is a map
 64 00:03:31.283 --> 00:03:33.873 from the International Organization for Migration.
 65 00:03:34.720 --> 00:03:38.420 They have regional maps for all of the major regions
 66 00:03:38.420 --> 00:03:41.920 of the world that are experiencing climate related migration
 67 00:03:42.950 --> 00:03:44.660 as a result of climate change.
 68 00:03:44.660 --> 00:03:47.060 So I'd like to highlight on this map
 69 00:03:47.060 --> 00:03:49.960 a couple of the key causes.
 70 00:03:49.960 --> 00:03:52.880 So you have some climate change hotspots
 71 00:03:54.210 --> 00:03:57.560 and you have risk of desertification,

72 00:03:57.560 --> 00:04:01.860 lower precipitation in some areas leading to floods

73 00:04:01.860 --> 00:04:06.550 that are preventing reliable growing of crops

74 00:04:06.550 --> 00:04:10.380 as populations have in the past relied upon.

75 00:04:10.380 --> 00:04:15.020 We also have some areas with less precipitation,

76 00:04:15.020 --> 00:04:18.640 again, impacting food production.

77 00:04:18.640 --> 00:04:23.320 We have negative agricultural changes, ecosystem changes,

78 00:04:23.320 --> 00:04:27.790 reduced water availability, depletion of fisheries,

79 00:04:27.790 --> 00:04:31.530 melting of glaciers which is leading to sedimentation

80 00:04:31.530 --> 00:04:34.603 and affecting again, water and crop supplies,

81 00:04:35.490 --> 00:04:39.050 there's impacts on mountain regions, coral bleaching,

82 00:04:39.050 --> 00:04:41.420 and of course sea level rise concerns.

83 00:04:41.420 --> 00:04:45.860 So I think this is a nice way just in one region to see

84 00:04:45.860 --> 00:04:49.430 the numerous ways in which climate change

85 00:04:49.430 --> 00:04:54.430 is affecting migration patterns and disrupting pre-existing

86 00:04:55.010 --> 00:04:57.223 reliable structures of assessments.

87 00:04:58.530 --> 00:05:01.950 We've also seen a trend historically documented

88 00:05:01.950 --> 00:05:05.400 in the scientific literature and increasingly

89 00:05:05.400 --> 00:05:10.400 in the defense department regarding the real human toll

90 00:05:10.800 --> 00:05:15.800 of disrupting reliable sources of water and of the impact

91 00:05:16.670 --> 00:05:21.670 of drought on leading to higher likelihood of conflict

92 00:05:22.010 --> 00:05:24.670 and conflict ultimately leading

93 00:05:24.670 --> 00:05:28.370 to migration changes as well.

94 00:05:28.370 --> 00:05:33.370 So we have the sort of natural effects that are occurring

95 00:05:33.690 --> 00:05:38.300 with humans having limited resources.

96 00:05:38.300 --> 00:05:40.380 But then of course there's a psychological
 97 00:05:40.380 --> 00:05:45.290 and social dynamics that complicate and multiply
 98 00:05:45.290 --> 00:05:48.640 the existing natural dynamics as individuals
 99 00:05:48.640 --> 00:05:51.223 are competing for scarce resources,
 100 00:05:52.100 --> 00:05:56.420 which historically has never led to a positive outcome.
 101 00:05:56.420 --> 00:05:59.990 So how can we think about all of this ethically?
 102 00:05:59.990 --> 00:06:03.210 I think what is really challenging on topics such as this,
 103 00:06:03.210 --> 00:06:06.160 that involve marginalized global populations
 104 00:06:06.160 --> 00:06:10.440 that tend to be invisible in society such as ours
 105 00:06:10.440 --> 00:06:13.380 in our typical power structures,
 106 00:06:13.380 --> 00:06:17.330 we need to try to think very objectively in ethics.
 107 00:06:17.330 --> 00:06:21.670 So there are a set of ways of doing this
 108 00:06:21.670 --> 00:06:24.620 that emphasis been put forth that I think are essential
 109 00:06:24.620 --> 00:06:29.620 as we can try to bypass biases and prejudices
 110 00:06:29.840 --> 00:06:31.390 and our failure to recognize
 111 00:06:31.390 --> 00:06:34.560 the innate human rights inequality of all individuals.
 112 00:06:34.560 --> 00:06:37.790 So first being reasonable not doctrinaire,
 113 00:06:37.790 --> 00:06:40.300 listening actively to the voices,
 114 00:06:40.300 --> 00:06:43.940 particularly the voices of those who don't have
 115 00:06:43.940 --> 00:06:48.520 a powerful position in the world community,
 116 00:06:48.520 --> 00:06:50.840 letting the best reasons determine judgments
 117 00:06:50.840 --> 00:06:55.133 versus economics politics or other competing interests,
 118 00:06:56.010 --> 00:06:59.730 remaining common optimistic in the face of controversy,
 119 00:06:59.730 --> 00:07:00.990 but at the same time,
 120 00:07:00.990 --> 00:07:04.150 being realistic about the situations and choices

121 00:07:04.150 --> 00:07:07.910 that we face and understanding that we don't necessarily

122 00:07:07.910 --> 00:07:09.480 have silver bullets here.

123 00:07:09.480 --> 00:07:12.380 And this is a problem that is going to require some level

124 00:07:12.380 --> 00:07:15.563 of active engagement in serious work.

125 00:07:16.620 --> 00:07:19.810 And also considering critically the approaches

126 00:07:19.810 --> 00:07:21.280 of different cultures,

127 00:07:21.280 --> 00:07:26.280 understanding that solutions to our existing climate crisis,

128 00:07:26.930 --> 00:07:30.790 ideally should be coming out of an open

129 00:07:30.790 --> 00:07:35.110 and sincere engagement with different cultural,

130 00:07:35.110 --> 00:07:38.130 ethical responses and implications

131 00:07:38.130 --> 00:07:40.000 of those ethical responses.

132 00:07:40.000 --> 00:07:42.910 Because we have a certain environment

133 00:07:42.910 --> 00:07:46.880 in which the industrialized nations are operating

134 00:07:46.880 --> 00:07:51.590 under social and cultural assumptions of how

135 00:07:51.590 --> 00:07:55.700 we should engage with the planet and the economic system

136 00:07:55.700 --> 00:07:57.580 in which we engage with the planet.

137 00:07:57.580 --> 00:08:01.380 And there are certainly other approaches from other cultures

138 00:08:01.380 --> 00:08:03.080 that are much more sustainable

139 00:08:03.080 --> 00:08:04.470 and from an ethical perspective,

140 00:08:04.470 --> 00:08:09.470 we have an obligation to be open and to consider the variety

141 00:08:09.910 --> 00:08:12.130 of approaches that could potentially lead

142 00:08:12.130 --> 00:08:15.660 to a more sustainable and effective and fair future

143 00:08:15.660 --> 00:08:18.283 for all populations around the planet.

144 00:08:19.530 --> 00:08:22.960 So there are some key ethical principles primary

145 00:08:22.960 --> 00:08:25.770 to climate change and health.

146 00:08:25.770 --> 00:08:28.070 Number one, scientific integrity.
147 00:08:28.070 --> 00:08:32.320 And this is the concept of honesty and truth
telling.
148 00:08:32.320 --> 00:08:35.480 And I think this is a critical point to emphasize
149 00:08:35.480 --> 00:08:39.540 because oftentimes particularly in climate
discussions,
150 00:08:39.540 --> 00:08:43.900 there is misinformation a whole host
151 00:08:43.900 --> 00:08:48.900 of industries promoting alternative pseudo-
science.
152 00:08:50.580 --> 00:08:55.140 But we also have a tendency to avoid the
gravity
153 00:08:55.140 --> 00:09:00.140 of the problem and to try to not deal with it
154 00:09:00.740 --> 00:09:05.150 because of the severity of the challenges
155 00:09:05.150 --> 00:09:06.220 that humanity faces.
156 00:09:06.220 --> 00:09:11.110 So there's an ethical value of telling the truth
157 00:09:11.110 --> 00:09:15.567 and being explicit about the reality that we
are facing
158 00:09:15.567 --> 00:09:19.090 and to ensure that what we are sharing is
unbiased
159 00:09:19.090 --> 00:09:22.530 and reflecting, not the cultural objectives
160 00:09:22.530 --> 00:09:24.840 of one specific environment,
161 00:09:24.840 --> 00:09:29.030 but the actual scientific scenario that the
entire world
162 00:09:29.030 --> 00:09:30.580 is facing right now.
163 00:09:30.580 --> 00:09:33.960 The next core principle that I think is crucial
here
164 00:09:33.960 --> 00:09:36.860 and that has been typically put forth in the
literature
165 00:09:36.860 --> 00:09:39.430 on climate change and public health ethics
166 00:09:39.430 --> 00:09:41.290 is the concept of justice.
167 00:09:41.290 --> 00:09:43.150 And this is that public health professionals
168 00:09:43.150 --> 00:09:44.820 should highlight differences
169 00:09:44.820 --> 00:09:47.920 that affect health status unfairly,

170 00:09:47.920 --> 00:09:50.450 and that we should emphasize basic human rights

171 00:09:50.450 --> 00:09:54.090 and define activities and legal conditions to ensure

172 00:09:54.090 --> 00:09:57.190 the achievement of basic right and a decent life

173 00:09:57.190 --> 00:10:01.823 for all people regardless of their location of birth.

174 00:10:02.860 --> 00:10:07.080 And the third principle is the concept ethically of welfare.

175 00:10:07.080 --> 00:10:08.330 And this is the principle

176 00:10:08.330 --> 00:10:11.410 that every person's happiness counts,

177 00:10:11.410 --> 00:10:14.450 regardless of their location.

178 00:10:14.450 --> 00:10:18.930 All individuals around the world have an equal human right

179 00:10:18.930 --> 00:10:22.163 for their happiness to be considered.

180 00:10:24.290 --> 00:10:28.510 So the challenge of climate migration ethics is that,

181 00:10:28.510 --> 00:10:31.420 many of the migrating populations most affected

182 00:10:31.420 --> 00:10:35.660 by rising sea levels, drought and extreme heat

183 00:10:35.660 --> 00:10:37.590 are also populations that have

184 00:10:37.590 --> 00:10:40.030 had smaller carbon footprints.

185 00:10:40.030 --> 00:10:42.423 So this is a real justice question.

186 00:10:45.150 --> 00:10:48.620 Looking at our own population here in the United States,

187 00:10:48.620 --> 00:10:52.020 US populations have not been severely displaced

188 00:10:52.020 --> 00:10:55.470 by rising sea levels, drought and heat.

189 00:10:55.470 --> 00:11:00.140 We've had over a million individuals in the past affected

190 00:11:00.140 --> 00:11:04.880 by these issues, but we've also had substantial resources

191 00:11:04.880 --> 00:11:07.703 and abilities to respond to this challenge.

192 00:11:08.850 --> 00:11:11.030 But looking at a global sage,

193 00:11:11.030 --> 00:11:16.030 we are not the populations that are experiencing the effects

194 00:11:16.470 --> 00:11:20.250 of greenhouse gas consumption at the levels that others are

195 00:11:20.250 --> 00:11:24.210 with regard to displacement on account of rising sea level,

196 00:11:24.210 --> 00:11:29.110 drought, heat, and other anomalous weather disasters.

197 00:11:29.110 --> 00:11:32.890 However, we've contributed much more carbon per capita

198 00:11:32.890 --> 00:11:37.000 than most of the populations that are now having to relocate

199 00:11:37.000 --> 00:11:41.453 due in part to the climate effects of US carbon consumption.

200 00:11:41.453 --> 00:11:44.170 And so this is a nice map looking at 2020

201 00:11:44.170 --> 00:11:47.000 internally displaced populations

202 00:11:47.000 --> 00:11:50.830 from the Internal Displacement Monitoring Center.

203 00:11:50.830 --> 00:11:53.660 And so you can see that this is a problem that we feel,

204 00:11:53.660 --> 00:11:57.360 but again, given the economic capacities

205 00:11:57.360 --> 00:12:01.360 that we have to rebound from climate anomalies,

206 00:12:01.360 --> 00:12:05.540 we're not feeling the effects as severely as individuals

207 00:12:05.540 --> 00:12:08.620 with less resources available to them.

208 00:12:08.620 --> 00:12:12.840 But also we're simply not feeling looking at the map,

209 00:12:12.840 --> 00:12:16.083 the effects as severely as some parts of the world.

210 00:12:17.150 --> 00:12:22.030 So it's a real problem of creating a problem without feeling

211 00:12:22.030 --> 00:12:25.090 and seeing the consequences of our actions directly

212 00:12:25.090 --> 00:12:29.380 in our day to day lives the extent that other individual

213 00:12:29.380 --> 00:12:30.563 on the planet Earth.

214 00:12:31.540 --> 00:12:35.850 So thinking about the ethical value of scientific integrity,

215 00:12:35.850 --> 00:12:38.950 700 million people are in the most vulnerable countries

216 00:12:38.950 --> 00:12:41.520 to climate change, including Afghanistan, Bangladesh,

217 00:12:41.520 --> 00:12:46.520 Barbados, Bhutan, Costa Rica, Ethiopia, Ghana, Kenya,

218 00:12:46.620 --> 00:12:50.950 Kiribati, Madagascar, the Maldives, Nepal, the Philippines,

219 00:12:50.950 --> 00:12:55.730 Rwanda, Saint Lucia, Tanzania, Timor-Leste, Tuvalu,

220 00:12:55.730 --> 00:12:57.900 Vanuatu and Vietnam.

221 00:12:57.900 --> 00:13:00.580 While these countries are most at risk,

222 00:13:00.580 --> 00:13:04.310 they are among the lowest contributors of greenhouse gases

223 00:13:04.310 --> 00:13:06.350 that are primarily responsible

224 00:13:06.350 --> 00:13:08.493 for human cause climate change.

225 00:13:09.580 --> 00:13:13.020 So it's not just an ethical challenge, it's almost an irony,

226 00:13:13.020 --> 00:13:14.820 almost an ethical irony.

227 00:13:14.820 --> 00:13:17.790 But the individuals who are hardest hit by the effects

228 00:13:17.790 --> 00:13:22.790 of climate change are also those who are contributing least

229 00:13:23.020 --> 00:13:24.103 to the problem.

230 00:13:25.160 --> 00:13:27.990 These countries are also burdened with the double stress

231 00:13:28.900 --> 00:13:30.430 as they work to tackle

232 00:13:30.430 --> 00:13:34.750 internal climate related hazards, including displacement.

233 00:13:34.750 --> 00:13:37.200 They also serve as receiving countries

234 00:13:37.200 --> 00:13:39.563 to growing numbers of refugees.

235 00:13:42.720 --> 00:13:44.600 So again, thinking about the ethical value

236 00:13:44.600 --> 00:13:49.220 of scientific integrity as a way to frame our conversation

237 00:13:49.220 --> 00:13:53.210 and have an accurate understanding of the data upon

238 00:13:53.210 --> 00:13:56.070 which we can build an ethical argument

239 00:13:56.070 --> 00:13:58.230 for what should be done,

240 00:13:58.230 --> 00:14:00.950 the top three resource of greenhouse gas emissions

241 00:14:00.950 --> 00:14:05.210 are China, the United States and the European Union.

242 00:14:05.210 --> 00:14:07.550 And you can see in this chart,

243 00:14:07.550 --> 00:14:12.550 we're looking at tons per person of carbon consumption.

244 00:14:13.810 --> 00:14:15.790 And so the United States

245 00:14:15.790 --> 00:14:20.683 has on the highest per capita greenhouse gas emissions.

246 00:14:22.010 --> 00:14:26.960 And we also need to think about what is being covered

247 00:14:26.960 --> 00:14:29.573 in these types of measurements.

248 00:14:31.050 --> 00:14:35.450 Because this is looking at per capita consumption

249 00:14:35.450 --> 00:14:40.197 and we have typical dependence in the US on industries

250 00:14:41.690 --> 00:14:45.280 that are recorded typically in per capita consumption

251 00:14:45.280 --> 00:14:48.290 in the development of products, say in China

252 00:14:48.290 --> 00:14:52.520 that are then shipped to the United States for consumption.

253 00:14:52.520 --> 00:14:56.400 So we're also needing to be aware of the ways

254 00:14:56.400 --> 00:15:00.030 that other parts of the world are producing emissions

255 00:15:00.030 --> 00:15:04.243 in part to reflect our demand for consumption.

256 00:15:05.310 --> 00:15:08.993 So thinking about climate change ethics at a global scale,

257 00:15:09.950 --> 00:15:13.390 nations that contributed leads to climate change

258 00:15:13.390 --> 00:15:16.220 will be suffering the worst consequences.

259 00:15:16.220 --> 00:15:21.220 So this is a map that is adjusted on the top for billions

260 00:15:22.010 --> 00:15:26.510 of tons of carbon produced and the nations

261 00:15:26.510 --> 00:15:31.020 are inflated to show carbon production.

262 00:15:31.020 --> 00:15:32.660 And then on the bottom we're looking at

263 00:15:32.660 --> 00:15:36.230 the mortality per million in the population

264 00:15:36.230 --> 00:15:39.410 as a result of the effects of climate change.

265 00:15:39.410 --> 00:15:44.410 And you can see that particularly for sub-Saharan Africa,

266 00:15:45.040 --> 00:15:48.030 these are pretty severely disproportionate,

267 00:15:48.030 --> 00:15:52.563 so that they're facing the consequences of pre-assumption,

268 00:15:53.400 --> 00:15:56.420 that we are not facing the consequences of

269 00:15:56.420 --> 00:15:57.730 while at the same time,

270 00:15:57.730 --> 00:16:01.163 they're not causing the problem that they are dealing with.

271 00:16:02.810 --> 00:16:07.310 Similarly, you see this happening in South Asia.

272 00:16:07.310 --> 00:16:12.230 And if we are looking at the areas of the world

273 00:16:12.230 --> 00:16:15.810 that are going to be particularly vulnerable

274 00:16:15.810 --> 00:16:19.733 to sea level rise, a lot of that is in the Pacific region.

275 00:16:21.290 --> 00:16:24.270 And we also need to recognize that within countries,

276 00:16:24.270 --> 00:16:28.720 poor and marginalized populations are at greater risk,

277 00:16:28.720 --> 00:16:30.550 although we will all be vulnerable.

278 00:16:30.550 --> 00:16:35.550 So this is to say that what we've seen in the literature

279 00:16:36.270 --> 00:16:38.390 on climate change and health outcomes,

280 00:16:38.390 --> 00:16:43.390 is that impoverished individuals are more susceptible

281 00:16:43.880 --> 00:16:47.390 to keep related illness

282 00:16:47.390 --> 00:16:49.660 as a result of occupational exposure,

283 00:16:49.660 --> 00:16:53.090 more likely lower income individuals

284 00:16:53.090 --> 00:16:54.980 are going to be working outdoors

285 00:16:54.980 --> 00:16:57.430 than higher income individuals.

286 00:16:57.430 --> 00:17:01.210 And they're more likely to lose income as a result of days

287 00:17:01.210 --> 00:17:02.950 of not being able to work,

288 00:17:02.950 --> 00:17:06.310 but also working under stress conditions that are putting

289 00:17:06.310 --> 00:17:10.940 their bodies at higher risk of early morbidity and mortality

290 00:17:10.940 --> 00:17:14.540 due to worse elemental exposure.

291 00:17:14.540 --> 00:17:16.420 And then we also see individuals

292 00:17:16.420 --> 00:17:18.990 who are lower income having less access

293 00:17:18.990 --> 00:17:21.240 to cooling facilities,

294 00:17:21.240 --> 00:17:24.080 less access to personal air conditioning,

295 00:17:24.080 --> 00:17:29.080 and particularly in regions of the world but are low

296 00:17:29.530 --> 00:17:33.950 and middle income countries access to cooling facilities

297 00:17:33.950 --> 00:17:37.180 is not always readily available for all individuals

298 00:17:37.180 --> 00:17:38.210 who need it.

299 00:17:38.210 --> 00:17:40.920 And so this is also contributing

300 00:17:40.920 --> 00:17:43.413 to earlier morbidity and mortality.

301 00:17:45.360 --> 00:17:49.500 But at a global level we see this and within countries,

302 00:17:49.500 --> 00:17:54.500 individuals at the earlier and later ends

303 00:17:54.640 --> 00:17:56.430 of the life spectrum tend

304 00:17:56.430 --> 00:17:59.003 to be more vulnerable physiologically.

305 00:18:00.090 --> 00:18:02.650 Which is also to say that we all,
 306 00:18:02.650 --> 00:18:07.420 as we age will be more vulnerable to the
 experiences
 307 00:18:07.420 --> 00:18:10.763 of particularly heat exposures,
 308 00:18:11.870 --> 00:18:15.180 something to consider as well.
 309 00:18:15.180 --> 00:18:18.530 So the principle of justice is the next ethical
 concept
 310 00:18:18.530 --> 00:18:20.620 that is really critical to thinking
 311 00:18:20.620 --> 00:18:23.060 about the ethics of climate migration.
 312 00:18:23.060 --> 00:18:24.940 So according to the principle of justice,
 313 00:18:24.940 --> 00:18:27.070 populations that produce greenhouse gases
 314 00:18:27.070 --> 00:18:30.500 are responsible for the consequences of our
 actions.
 315 00:18:30.500 --> 00:18:34.000 This is justices at fairness and it's the same
 316 00:18:34.000 --> 00:18:36.230 sort of justice principle that we see
 317 00:18:36.230 --> 00:18:39.817 in our typical civil society laws where you
 break it
 318 00:18:39.817 --> 00:18:41.630 and you buy it.
 319 00:18:41.630 --> 00:18:45.520 You violate the policy of society, you use fee,
 320 00:18:45.520 --> 00:18:46.633 you get a ticket.
 321 00:18:47.820 --> 00:18:50.960 It's just a basic principle that we are respon-
 sible
 322 00:18:50.960 --> 00:18:53.570 for the consequences of our own behaviors
 323 00:18:53.570 --> 00:18:54.910 and our consumption.
 324 00:18:54.910 --> 00:18:57.500 Climate migrants are without homes as a
 result
 325 00:18:57.500 --> 00:19:00.560 of global carbon consumption.
 326 00:19:00.560 --> 00:19:02.270 And so in a perfectly fair world,
 327 00:19:02.270 --> 00:19:06.040 each population that is not itself displaced
 328 00:19:06.040 --> 00:19:08.570 by climate change would be responsible
 329 00:19:08.570 --> 00:19:12.420 for accommodating climate migrants in a ratio
 commensurate
 330 00:19:12.420 --> 00:19:15.190 to that nation's responsibility for causing

331 00:19:15.190 --> 00:19:17.370 the climate refugee crisis.
 332 00:19:17.370 --> 00:19:19.680 That is, nations would be held accountable
 333 00:19:19.680 --> 00:19:21.550 for the human consequences
 334 00:19:21.550 --> 00:19:23.950 of their greenhouse gas consumption.
 335 00:19:23.950 --> 00:19:26.620 And the principle of fairness justifies policies
 336 00:19:26.620 --> 00:19:28.220 in which producers of vast quantities
 337 00:19:28.220 --> 00:19:33.143 of greenhouse gases welcome large numbers
 of refugees.
 338 00:19:34.310 --> 00:19:36.310 Further the industrialized world
 339 00:19:36.310 --> 00:19:39.850 has created climate changes displacing popu-
 lations
 340 00:19:39.850 --> 00:19:43.290 and forcing those individuals into migrant
 status.
 341 00:19:43.290 --> 00:19:46.730 So the source of the problem is global and
 therefore,
 342 00:19:46.730 --> 00:19:50.480 the response to this problem should equally
 be
 343 00:19:50.480 --> 00:19:51.773 at a global level.
 344 00:19:54.870 --> 00:19:57.810 We also have the ethical concept of human
 rights.
 345 00:19:57.810 --> 00:20:00.090 So according to Article 25
 346 00:20:00.090 --> 00:20:03.700 of the United Nations Universal Declaration
 of Human Rights,
 347 00:20:03.700 --> 00:20:06.360 everyone has the right to a standard of living
 adequate
 348 00:20:06.360 --> 00:20:08.490 for the health and wellbeing of him or herself
 349 00:20:08.490 --> 00:20:11.890 and of his or her family, including food, cloth-
 ing,
 350 00:20:11.890 --> 00:20:13.823 housing, and medical care.
 351 00:20:15.230 --> 00:20:17.100 All industrialized nations have agreed
 352 00:20:17.100 --> 00:20:19.440 to the universal declaration of human rights
 353 00:20:19.440 --> 00:20:22.170 and should endeavor therefore to achieve these
 rights
 354 00:20:22.170 --> 00:20:24.070 for all global populations.

355 00:20:24.070 --> 00:20:28.440 We know that human rights are aspirational and some nations

356 00:20:28.440 --> 00:20:31.920 have accomplished them much more effectively than others,

357 00:20:31.920 --> 00:20:34.510 but nevertheless, all industrialized nations

358 00:20:34.510 --> 00:20:36.540 have agree to these objectives.

359 00:20:36.540 --> 00:20:40.470 And so, this is an important international statement

360 00:20:40.470 --> 00:20:42.950 that nations have made that we share

361 00:20:42.950 --> 00:20:45.420 these basic human values

362 00:20:45.420 --> 00:20:49.950 and we have an obligation regardless of national origins

363 00:20:49.950 --> 00:20:54.270 or geographic boundaries to support the human rights

364 00:20:54.270 --> 00:20:57.963 of individuals on other parts of the planet.

365 00:21:00.130 --> 00:21:05.130 Another critical ethical concept is humanitarianism.

366 00:21:05.840 --> 00:21:09.910 So climate migrants were displaced on account of processes

367 00:21:09.910 --> 00:21:14.310 and events far beyond their own individual control.

368 00:21:14.310 --> 00:21:18.310 For many generations, we have had humanitarian responses

369 00:21:18.310 --> 00:21:21.350 and infrastructures for aiding displaced persons

370 00:21:21.350 --> 00:21:24.030 who lost their homes to disasters or conflicts

371 00:21:24.030 --> 00:21:26.610 beyond their individual control.

372 00:21:26.610 --> 00:21:29.880 So a humanitarian ethic motivates efforts

373 00:21:29.880 --> 00:21:34.673 to help those individuals in dire need for survival.

374 00:21:39.110 --> 00:21:43.350 I'd also like to talk about Welfare and the Harm Principle

375 00:21:43.350 --> 00:21:48.350 as ethical guidelines for climate migration ethics.

376 00:21:48.560 --> 00:21:53.560 So John Stewart Mill has been a sort of touchstone thinker

377 00:21:53.770 --> 00:21:58.680 in public health ethics for many generations now.

378 00:21:58.680 --> 00:22:03.510 And according to Mill, the Harm Principle stipulates

379 00:22:03.510 --> 00:22:08.180 that we are all free to behave as we like

380 00:22:08.180 --> 00:22:13.003 within a society until our behaviors cause harm to others.

381 00:22:13.940 --> 00:22:16.070 Many emphasis will point out that the Harm Principle

382 00:22:16.070 --> 00:22:19.410 and itself is insufficient to account

383 00:22:19.410 --> 00:22:22.470 for the ethical obligations that we would like to achieve

384 00:22:22.470 --> 00:22:25.520 in public health because we have additional values

385 00:22:25.520 --> 00:22:29.525 of human rights, justice, equality and fairness

386 00:22:29.525 --> 00:22:32.970 in humanitarianism that we've already discussed.

387 00:22:32.970 --> 00:22:37.817 But the Harm Principle is another ethical support

388 00:22:38.690 --> 00:22:41.440 for thinking about climate migration

389 00:22:41.440 --> 00:22:43.800 in a way that is inclusive.

390 00:22:43.800 --> 00:22:45.630 And so according to the Harm Principle,

391 00:22:45.630 --> 00:22:47.520 everyone's happiness matters.

392 00:22:47.520 --> 00:22:50.280 The wellbeing and lives of displaced persons

393 00:22:50.280 --> 00:22:53.220 should therefore be considered.

394 00:22:53.220 --> 00:22:55.310 The wellbeing and lives of populations

395 00:22:55.310 --> 00:22:58.150 that produce large quantities of greenhouse gases

396 00:22:58.150 --> 00:22:59.280 should also be considered.

397 00:22:59.280 --> 00:23:01.550 However, according to the Harm Principle,

398 00:23:01.550 --> 00:23:04.620 the freedom of major polluters to continue causing damage

399 00:23:04.620 --> 00:23:07.470 to the planet should ethically be constrained
400 00:23:07.470 --> 00:23:11.730 to the extent that this behavior causes harm
to others.

401 00:23:11.730 --> 00:23:13.930 Further the wellbeing of these populations
402 00:23:13.930 --> 00:23:17.810 must be considered in combination with other
ethical demands

403 00:23:17.810 --> 00:23:18.960 that we have discussed.

404 00:23:20.280 --> 00:23:23.480 And I think that is an important interesting
aside to make

405 00:23:23.480 --> 00:23:26.070 that while there is sound ethical justification
406 00:23:26.070 --> 00:23:29.010 for large greenhouse gas consumers to have
an ethical duty

407 00:23:29.010 --> 00:23:31.190 to welcome climate refugees.

408 00:23:31.190 --> 00:23:33.190 Interestingly and completely independent
409 00:23:33.190 --> 00:23:35.120 of this ethical justification,

410 00:23:35.120 --> 00:23:36.930 nations that have produced large quantities
411 00:23:36.930 --> 00:23:40.070 of greenhouse gases stand to benefit econom-
ically

412 00:23:40.070 --> 00:23:41.760 from welcoming climate refugees on account
413 00:23:41.760 --> 00:23:44.760 of their aging domestic populations.

414 00:23:44.760 --> 00:23:46.050 Which to say that,

415 00:23:46.050 --> 00:23:49.760 even in this highly charged political climate
416 00:23:49.760 --> 00:23:53.610 where public health ethics intersect

417 00:23:53.610 --> 00:23:56.020 with the policy discussions,

418 00:23:56.020 --> 00:24:00.010 we have members of society who have taken
stances

419 00:24:00.010 --> 00:24:03.273 of isolationism and closed border.

420 00:24:04.230 --> 00:24:08.050 Whereas as even conservative economists have
pointed out

421 00:24:08.050 --> 00:24:12.980 that aging high income countries would stand
to benefit

422 00:24:12.980 --> 00:24:16.960 from expanding their populations

423 00:24:16.960 --> 00:24:20.360 by welcoming international migrants to con-
tribute

424 00:24:20.360 --> 00:24:24.550 to the economic capacity of those countries.

425 00:24:24.550 --> 00:24:29.550 So the is a sort of response to the utilitarian arguments

426 00:24:29.570 --> 00:24:34.350 that are typically made as a sort of ethical response

427 00:24:34.350 --> 00:24:37.900 from those who oppose welcoming strategies,

428 00:24:37.900 --> 00:24:42.240 which is to say that there's been an argument that bringing

429 00:24:42.240 --> 00:24:47.240 in individuals to a society takes jobs

430 00:24:47.680 --> 00:24:51.330 from that domestic population.

431 00:24:51.330 --> 00:24:55.210 And so there is an obligation that the society

432 00:24:55.210 --> 00:25:00.210 has to protect the jobs of their domestic populations

433 00:25:00.510 --> 00:25:02.670 so that they can find employment.

434 00:25:02.670 --> 00:25:06.470 This is sort of the argument that is made,

435 00:25:06.470 --> 00:25:11.030 that is not accounting for any of the social duties

436 00:25:11.030 --> 00:25:14.650 and obligations that we have to climate refugees

437 00:25:14.650 --> 00:25:16.910 as a result of our greenhouse gas consumption.

438 00:25:16.910 --> 00:25:18.680 But is an argument that's out there

439 00:25:18.680 --> 00:25:21.850 and I think it's something that should be engaged with.

440 00:25:21.850 --> 00:25:26.850 And interestingly from even utilitarian perspective,

441 00:25:27.460 --> 00:25:32.460 there is actually a good benefit to aging societies

442 00:25:34.060 --> 00:25:38.740 such as our own to bring in a broader work base

443 00:25:38.740 --> 00:25:41.980 to support our economy because we actually don't have

444 00:25:41.980 --> 00:25:45.970 the domestic workforce to supply the demand

445 00:25:45.970 --> 00:25:49.630 that we have for in employment even within

446 00:25:49.630 --> 00:25:52.790 the existing economy that we have.

447 00:25:52.790 --> 00:25:57.790 So, there's a really strong argument across all perspectives

448 00:25:59.800 --> 00:26:04.260 from the political spectrum for having

449 00:26:04.260 --> 00:26:08.120 a welcoming environment for the victim

450 00:26:08.120 --> 00:26:11.123 of global greenhouse gas consumption.

451 00:26:20.090 --> 00:26:23.740 So I'd like to close by asking the question then,

452 00:26:23.740 --> 00:26:27.210 given all of this information in all of these principles,

453 00:26:27.210 --> 00:26:30.923 what is our ethical duty to climate migrants?

454 00:26:32.480 --> 00:26:36.080 Major carbon-producing countries, such as the US,

455 00:26:36.080 --> 00:26:37.100 I would pause it,

456 00:26:37.100 --> 00:26:40.100 have an ethical obligation to address the relocation needs

457 00:26:40.100 --> 00:26:43.970 of large numbers of refugees who are migrating

458 00:26:43.970 --> 00:26:46.940 due to the effects of climate change.

459 00:26:46.940 --> 00:26:48.480 This is not something

460 00:26:48.480 --> 00:26:50.870 that has always been politically popular,

461 00:26:50.870 --> 00:26:55.870 and certainly if we look at even the acceptance that we have

462 00:26:55.970 --> 00:26:58.700 at our southern border of turning away today

463 00:26:58.700 --> 00:27:00.763 around 50% of applicants,

464 00:27:02.330 --> 00:27:05.280 many of these migrants are moving

465 00:27:05.280 --> 00:27:07.000 as a result of climate change.

466 00:27:07.000 --> 00:27:12.000 And I think we have an ethical obligation to be more open

467 00:27:13.350 --> 00:27:18.350 and to be more welcoming and to also face the consequences

468 00:27:19.440 --> 00:27:23.890 of our own historic benefits from exploiting

469 00:27:23.890 --> 00:27:28.027 the natural resources of the planet and also to realize

470 00:27:29.550 --> 00:27:34.400 the demands that those benefits place on other members

471 00:27:34.400 --> 00:27:37.410 of the global community and accommodating
472 00:27:38.260 --> 00:27:40.283 the consequences of our actions.
473 00:27:43.550 --> 00:27:45.763 So, I'm happy to take questions now.
474 00:27:54.120 --> 00:27:59.000 <v ->So I guess maybe should we have people
put questions</v>
475 00:27:59.000 --> 00:28:01.343 into the chat Laura or in turns?
476 00:28:03.040 --> 00:28:06.670 <v ->Yeah, chat or raise hand?</v>
477 00:28:06.670 --> 00:28:10.320 <v ->Yeah, so I could start while people are
thinking</v>
478 00:28:10.320 --> 00:28:12.213 of their questions.
479 00:28:14.450 --> 00:28:19.450 Do you know if there's any discussion inter-
nationally,
480 00:28:19.710 --> 00:28:24.710 like in the UN or otherwise about this issue
and like,
481 00:28:25.990 --> 00:28:28.740 particularly, I know there's been discussion in
the past
482 00:28:28.740 --> 00:28:32.460 of formally recognizing climate refugees
483 00:28:32.460 --> 00:28:36.593 as a class of refugees do you know if that's
going anywhere?
484 00:28:37.950 --> 00:28:40.830 <v ->From what I've seen, there's progress
being made,</v>
485 00:28:40.830 --> 00:28:44.907 the agencies that I've been consulting for this
project
486 00:28:45.900 --> 00:28:49.700 have all been advocating for that shift.
487 00:28:49.700 --> 00:28:54.700 And I think that there's strong argument to
be made.
488 00:28:56.350 --> 00:28:58.560 So there seems to be movement
489 00:28:58.560 --> 00:29:01.047 in this direction, Dr. Krispin?
490 00:29:08.900 --> 00:29:10.690 <v Instructor>Thank you so much,
Laura.</v>
491 00:29:10.690 --> 00:29:14.810 You're making a strong case for why the US
has an obligation
492 00:29:14.810 --> 00:29:19.510 to welcome so-called climate refugees and sort
of building
493 00:29:19.510 --> 00:29:22.510 on what Rob just said, to my knowledge,

494 00:29:22.510 --> 00:29:24.060 there is no legal protection.

495 00:29:24.060 --> 00:29:29.060 The international law does not recognize climate refugees.

496 00:29:31.213 --> 00:29:33.820 So and my guess is,

497 00:29:33.820 --> 00:29:36.060 countries that are for acting quite reluctant

498 00:29:36.060 --> 00:29:39.670 including the United States to welcome any kind of refugees

499 00:29:39.670 --> 00:29:41.770 or political refugees, et cetera,

500 00:29:41.770 --> 00:29:44.263 I think there's gonna be a lot of pushback

501 00:29:44.263 --> 00:29:48.270 'cause if they add climate refugees to the list of refugees,

502 00:29:48.270 --> 00:29:51.610 all of a sudden they need to welcome because they've signed

503 00:29:51.610 --> 00:29:55.260 the agreement convention for refugees 1951.

504 00:29:55.260 --> 00:29:57.450 So I'm kind of trying to figure out

505 00:29:57.450 --> 00:30:00.760 how we can move forward with that.

506 00:30:00.760 --> 00:30:03.230 But another question I have is,

507 00:30:03.230 --> 00:30:07.000 a lot of these climate induced migrants

508 00:30:07.000 --> 00:30:09.930 are actually being dislocated internally.

509 00:30:09.930 --> 00:30:12.270 So they're internally displaced people.

510 00:30:12.270 --> 00:30:15.343 So whether they're in Somalia, whether they're in Sudan,

511 00:30:16.530 --> 00:30:19.140 most of them I guess is are not leaving the country

512 00:30:19.140 --> 00:30:24.140 because they can't, but they're leaving their home,

513 00:30:24.280 --> 00:30:27.290 they go into an urban setting looking for jobs.

514 00:30:27.290 --> 00:30:29.820 So it makes it even more complicated

515 00:30:29.820 --> 00:30:32.640 in terms of US obligation,

516 00:30:32.640 --> 00:30:35.900 should US be supporting the Somalian government.

517 00:30:35.900 --> 00:30:37.080 the Sudanese government,

518 00:30:37.080 --> 00:30:39.750 to take care of internally displaced people

519 00:30:39.750 --> 00:30:41.340 who are displaced because of

520 00:30:41.340 --> 00:30:43.680 as you were mentioning climate related issues,

521 00:30:43.680 --> 00:30:47.880 we have a responsibility that we have caused to some extent.

522 00:30:47.880 --> 00:30:50.170 So the internal displaced people is something

523 00:30:50.170 --> 00:30:51.730 that I'm thinking about in addition

524 00:30:51.730 --> 00:30:55.800 to international refugees across the border

525 00:30:55.800 --> 00:30:57.380 into another country.

526 00:30:57.380 --> 00:31:00.030 <v ->Thank you. So let's start with your second question first</v>

527 00:31:00.030 --> 00:31:01.313 and I completely agree.

528 00:31:02.260 --> 00:31:05.190 I think that all of the ethical arguments put forth

529 00:31:05.190 --> 00:31:10.190 with regard to bringing in migrants internationally

530 00:31:10.710 --> 00:31:14.100 across borders still applies for internal displacement

531 00:31:14.100 --> 00:31:17.090 so that we have an obligation to assist

532 00:31:17.090 --> 00:31:22.090 with compensating societies that are paying environmentally

533 00:31:23.510 --> 00:31:26.793 for the consequences of our consumption.

534 00:31:28.080 --> 00:31:31.500 I understand that there's an uphill road for this,

535 00:31:31.500 --> 00:31:35.860 but nevertheless from an ethical perspective,

536 00:31:35.860 --> 00:31:40.860 this is an obligation that I think arguably exists.

537 00:31:42.030 --> 00:31:43.380 And I think that

538 00:31:43.380 --> 00:31:47.860 the recent Global Youth Movement regarding advocacy

539 00:31:47.860 --> 00:31:52.260 for their human rights has had an impact on the way

540 00:31:52.260 --> 00:31:56.840 that policy makers have been responding to ethical claims

541 00:31:56.840 --> 00:32:01.520 so that they're seeing that there's a certain level

542 00:32:01.520 --> 00:32:06.240 of value based accountability

543 00:32:06.240 --> 00:32:08.610 that policy makers should have.

544 00:32:08.610 --> 00:32:11.630 And there have been reactions even from the private sector

545 00:32:11.630 --> 00:32:16.580 in trying to reduce consumption as a sort of pay it forward

546 00:32:16.580 --> 00:32:17.840 to future generations.

547 00:32:17.840 --> 00:32:21.740 And I think having a broader voice for global populations

548 00:32:21.740 --> 00:32:26.210 that are internally displaced and also that are having

549 00:32:26.210 --> 00:32:28.130 to leave their nation altogether,

550 00:32:28.130 --> 00:32:30.670 whether it be lost to sea level rise

551 00:32:30.670 --> 00:32:34.830 or other extreme weather events that are making

552 00:32:34.830 --> 00:32:38.433 their home environment uninhabitable.

553 00:32:40.230 --> 00:32:43.000 I think that there's a place

554 00:32:43.000 --> 00:32:45.030 for a broader ethical discussion that if

555 00:32:45.030 --> 00:32:47.740 that conversation is heard,

556 00:32:47.740 --> 00:32:51.430 could at least make some progress in the same way that we

557 00:32:51.430 --> 00:32:56.430 have seen advocacy for the rights of future generations.

558 00:32:56.430 --> 00:32:58.770 Because I think when we all hear this information

559 00:32:58.770 --> 00:33:02.050 is very clear that this is something that is wrong

560 00:33:02.050 --> 00:33:05.623 and there's an ethical obligation to do something.

561 00:33:07.480 --> 00:33:12.480 And so my hope is that further discussion of this

562 00:33:13.830 --> 00:33:16.140 at an international level,

563 00:33:16.140 --> 00:33:18.370 so these populations are less ignored,

564 00:33:18.370 --> 00:33:21.970 can help to advance that.

565 00:33:21.970 --> 00:33:24.180 Going back to your first question

566 00:33:24.180 --> 00:33:29.180 about recognizing individuals as refugees,

567 00:33:29.210 --> 00:33:34.210 absolutely, I think that the current thinking
in this

568 00:33:34.770 --> 00:33:38.020 is to try to understand that at the time

569 00:33:38.020 --> 00:33:39.900 that our international agreement

570 00:33:39.900 --> 00:33:42.020 on refugee status concerned,

571 00:33:42.020 --> 00:33:45.760 we didn't have an awareness of climate change

572 00:33:45.760 --> 00:33:50.760 as human created source of displacement,

573 00:33:52.020 --> 00:33:55.890 although it is just as well as conflict

574 00:33:55.890 --> 00:33:57.690 in the discreet scenario.

575 00:33:57.690 --> 00:34:01.280 And so I think that this is something that

576 00:34:01.280 --> 00:34:05.560 we're seeing movement in thinking and I'm
hoping

577 00:34:05.560 --> 00:34:10.560 that this can be better acknowledged and
modernized

578 00:34:10.760 --> 00:34:15.760 because it is a reality of migration akin to any
other form

579 00:34:17.750 --> 00:34:22.750 of human behavior, we need to do migration.

580 00:34:23.420 --> 00:34:26.610 But it is more complicated of course,

581 00:34:26.610 --> 00:34:30.710 because it's multinational and the source of
the problem

582 00:34:30.710 --> 00:34:32.270 is more distant from the effect,

583 00:34:32.270 --> 00:34:35.160 but those who are fueling the effects or fueling
the effects

584 00:34:35.160 --> 00:34:37.703 very rapidly and very acutely.

585 00:34:38.550 --> 00:34:43.550 And so the humanitarian ethic of responding
to migrants,

586 00:34:44.280 --> 00:34:48.370 responding to refugees is really the same.

587 00:34:48.370 --> 00:34:51.660 And that's why I also think that some of the
conversations

588 00:34:51.660 --> 00:34:56.253 that we have focusing on the language are
stalling

589 00:34:59.120 --> 00:35:02.700 the actions that need to be taken right now regardless

590 00:35:02.700 --> 00:35:06.110 of the legal protections internationally.

591 00:35:06.110 --> 00:35:10.130 Because we also have refugee protections for populations

592 00:35:10.130 --> 00:35:14.480 in international law that according to the political will

593 00:35:14.480 --> 00:35:15.770 of certain environments,

594 00:35:15.770 --> 00:35:20.770 are not necessarily being fulfilled at a policy level.

595 00:35:20.980 --> 00:35:25.980 And so regardless of the legal environment and framework

596 00:35:26.820 --> 00:35:28.410 in which we're working,

597 00:35:28.410 --> 00:35:30.790 the same ethical duty applies

598 00:35:31.630 --> 00:35:34.280 to assisting these populations.

599 00:35:34.280 --> 00:35:37.000 So I'm hoping that the needle can be moved

600 00:35:37.000 --> 00:35:38.520 at a geopolitical level,

601 00:35:38.520 --> 00:35:41.380 but at the same time from an ethical perspective

602 00:35:41.380 --> 00:35:46.380 there's work to be done regardless of that.

603 00:35:46.430 --> 00:35:48.710 <v Instructor>Thank you so much.</v>

604 00:35:49.630 --> 00:35:51.380 <v ->See lots of hands, which is great.</v>

605 00:35:51.380 --> 00:35:53.583 I think Dr. Lason was next.

606 00:35:58.900 --> 00:36:00.790 <v Instructor>Hi Laura, thank you so much for this.</v>

607 00:36:00.790 --> 00:36:04.340 I think you made a really good case for the responsibility

608 00:36:04.340 --> 00:36:09.340 of mostly wealthy countries for taking in refugees

609 00:36:11.490 --> 00:36:13.530 because analyzing responsibility

610 00:36:13.530 --> 00:36:17.090 at the national level makes sense for a problem

611 00:36:17.090 --> 00:36:20.900 where the answer has to be worked out

612 00:36:20.900 --> 00:36:24.750 across national boundaries using national border policy

613 00:36:24.750 --> 00:36:27.673 and treaties that nations enter into and so on.
614 00:36:28.850 --> 00:36:30.490 But on the other hand,
615 00:36:30.490 --> 00:36:35.310 there's a list of about 100 companies that are responsible
616 00:36:35.310 --> 00:36:40.040 for more than 3/4 of all of the greenhouse gases
617 00:36:40.040 --> 00:36:41.410 in the atmosphere.
618 00:36:41.410 --> 00:36:44.510 And the vast majority of these countries exist now
619 00:36:44.510 --> 00:36:48.313 and existed back till about 1988.
620 00:36:49.200 --> 00:36:51.690 So you can actually say these firms
621 00:36:51.690 --> 00:36:53.470 that are there right now,
622 00:36:53.470 --> 00:36:56.600 a relatively small number of them are responsible
623 00:36:56.600 --> 00:36:59.113 for a huge amount of the burden.
624 00:37:01.000 --> 00:37:04.360 And I wonder if there aren't some kinds of problems
625 00:37:04.360 --> 00:37:08.270 like subsidizing displaced people internally
626 00:37:08.270 --> 00:37:11.370 to their countries that might be better analyzed
627 00:37:11.370 --> 00:37:16.370 at the firm level than at the nation state level.
628 00:37:16.700 --> 00:37:17.790 Does that make sense?
629 00:37:17.790 --> 00:37:18.623 <v ->Yeah. Thank you.</v>
630 00:37:18.623 --> 00:37:21.147 I think that's a great point because
631 00:37:21.147 --> 00:37:24.740 there are so many dynamics that go on in that conversation.
632 00:37:24.740 --> 00:37:28.555 There's sort of the passing the buck that can happen
633 00:37:28.555 --> 00:37:33.555 of companies transitioning that obligation
634 00:37:33.960 --> 00:37:35.640 toward governments which we've seen happen
635 00:37:35.640 --> 00:37:39.280 in so many scenarios, thinking of the financial crisis
636 00:37:39.280 --> 00:37:42.940 where those who created the problem

637 00:37:42.940 --> 00:37:47.940 as a result of their corporate behavior are shifting

638 00:37:48.370 --> 00:37:51.730 the clean up of that toward governments

639 00:37:51.730 --> 00:37:54.363 and that's certainly not fair.

640 00:37:55.760 --> 00:37:58.750 But there's also I think, the question of the role

641 00:37:58.750 --> 00:38:02.300 of governments then in corporate accountability.

642 00:38:02.300 --> 00:38:07.300 And this is something that we've seen not develop

643 00:38:07.550 --> 00:38:12.550 on this topic at all in the way that it could potentially

644 00:38:14.750 --> 00:38:16.030 with regard to having

645 00:38:16.030 --> 00:38:21.030 some sort of tax based system according

646 00:38:21.400 --> 00:38:26.400 to carbon production, carbon taxes that are then used

647 00:38:28.470 --> 00:38:33.350 to offset the human consequences of that production.

648 00:38:33.350 --> 00:38:38.350 There's a real missed opportunity I think there

649 00:38:38.410 --> 00:38:41.300 for using that resource.

650 00:38:41.300 --> 00:38:43.610 And then now we're seeing higher levels

651 00:38:43.610 --> 00:38:46.290 of internal corporate accountability as well,

652 00:38:46.290 --> 00:38:48.120 which I think is important.

653 00:38:48.120 --> 00:38:53.120 Certainly public health students go on to work sometimes

654 00:38:53.350 --> 00:38:58.350 within industry as corporate accountability monitors

655 00:39:00.050 --> 00:39:03.210 and industries are increasingly seeing

656 00:39:03.210 --> 00:39:08.210 that there is some economic personal benefit to be gained

657 00:39:08.560 --> 00:39:11.873 from having at least a green face.

658 00:39:13.120 --> 00:39:15.563 But I think at this point,

659 00:39:16.760 --> 00:39:19.830 we need to use all of the levers available to us

660 00:39:19.830 --> 00:39:21.960 and I think internal forms
661 00:39:21.960 --> 00:39:24.940 of corporate accountability are useful.
662 00:39:24.940 --> 00:39:27.590 They're certainly not sufficient
663 00:39:27.590 --> 00:39:30.400 because of the conflicting interest that those
individuals
664 00:39:30.400 --> 00:39:32.500 have in speaking up.
665 00:39:32.500 --> 00:39:35.740 You can only get so far when you're paid by
someone
666 00:39:35.740 --> 00:39:37.540 who you're also holding accountable.
667 00:39:38.600 --> 00:39:41.500 But that said, that's still a mechanism
668 00:39:41.500 --> 00:39:46.180 and an avenue through which companies stand
to look better
669 00:39:46.180 --> 00:39:50.180 to the public by doing something about this
issue.
670 00:39:50.180 --> 00:39:53.760 So that as you point out there are multiple
levers and ways
671 00:39:53.760 --> 00:39:56.023 that these objectives could be accomplished.
672 00:39:58.681 --> 00:40:01.237 I think the next question was in the chat
673 00:40:04.020 --> 00:40:04.853 for the presentation.
674 00:40:04.853 --> 00:40:06.840 Have you done your research on the effects
675 00:40:06.840 --> 00:40:10.600 of climate migration on modern slavery?
676 00:40:10.600 --> 00:40:13.313 That's a great, great question.
677 00:40:14.380 --> 00:40:18.090 Not personally, but I think that this is an
area
678 00:40:18.090 --> 00:40:23.090 that needs more research and we're also seeing
679 00:40:23.280 --> 00:40:26.850 the tragic reality that today in the world,
680 00:40:26.850 --> 00:40:30.180 there are more human slaves living than at
any time
681 00:40:30.180 --> 00:40:35.180 in history and conditions of scarcity and de-
mand for labor
682 00:40:39.340 --> 00:40:44.190 and resources are historically a pattern
683 00:40:44.190 --> 00:40:48.170 that we see continuing today in which the
absence

684 00:40:48.170 --> 00:40:52.770 of having reliable sources of income force individuals

685 00:40:52.770 --> 00:40:57.770 who are desperate into scenarios that are putting them

686 00:40:58.850 --> 00:41:03.310 into slavery even more commonly most,

687 00:41:03.310 --> 00:41:08.040 or a large portion of slaves today are children and families

688 00:41:08.040 --> 00:41:10.530 who are unable to support themselves in the ways

689 00:41:10.530 --> 00:41:14.260 that they historically have been or more prone

690 00:41:14.260 --> 00:41:18.840 to sell their children into these contexts.

691 00:41:18.840 --> 00:41:19.673 So thank you.

692 00:41:19.673 --> 00:41:22.310 I really appreciate question because,

693 00:41:22.310 --> 00:41:24.380 I think there's so much

694 00:41:24.380 --> 00:41:27.720 from an ethical perspective that is not making it

695 00:41:27.720 --> 00:41:31.680 into our everyday political conversations

696 00:41:31.680 --> 00:41:36.680 about climate change and the human rights of all individuals

697 00:41:37.080 --> 00:41:40.860 and particularly those who are most vulnerable

698 00:41:40.860 --> 00:41:45.470 to exploitation in slavery need to be discussed more

699 00:41:45.470 --> 00:41:48.770 as a part of this and it certainly.

700 00:41:48.770 --> 00:41:53.300 I think, raises more attention of the severity

701 00:41:53.300 --> 00:41:56.900 of the challenge and the need for something clear

702 00:41:56.900 --> 00:41:57.763 to be done.

703 00:42:00.397 --> 00:42:05.397 The next question is, I don't see your full name, Dr. Rall.

704 00:42:07.864 --> 00:42:08.910 <v Instructor>Hi. Yes, Laura.</v>

705 00:42:08.910 --> 00:42:12.990 Thank you for the very important issues that you raised.

706 00:42:12.990 --> 00:42:14.773 I had two questions if I may.

707 00:42:15.720 --> 00:42:17.200 I think you brought this up yourself,

708 00:42:17.200 --> 00:42:20.350 most of the migrations that we've seen historically

709 00:42:20.350 --> 00:42:22.450 tend to happen into neighboring countries.

710 00:42:22.450 --> 00:42:24.690 So either from Sudan into Northern Africa,

711 00:42:24.690 --> 00:42:26.440 Bangladesh to India, and the same

712 00:42:26.440 --> 00:42:29.163 is expected from climate change as well.

713 00:42:30.210 --> 00:42:32.350 And I was just thinking that,

714 00:42:32.350 --> 00:42:35.850 are there other important mechanisms of operationalizing

715 00:42:35.850 --> 00:42:38.650 this obligation for address

716 00:42:38.650 --> 00:42:43.483 or rather than just taking in refugees into the countries?

717 00:42:43.483 --> 00:42:46.490 Like I can't imagine the number of people

718 00:42:46.490 --> 00:42:47.323 we're talking about.

719 00:42:47.323 --> 00:42:51.180 India expect millions from Bangladesh and millions

720 00:42:51.180 --> 00:42:54.040 in Africa to be moving that taking people in

721 00:42:54.040 --> 00:42:57.150 is perhaps less important than addressing development needs

722 00:42:57.150 --> 00:42:59.163 in those countries or helping neighboring countries

723 00:42:59.163 --> 00:43:01.510 that are expecting refugees to be able to deal

724 00:43:01.510 --> 00:43:03.380 with the crisis themselves.

725 00:43:03.380 --> 00:43:05.853 So that's one question, second question.

726 00:43:06.687 --> 00:43:09.300 In the case of climate versus war,

727 00:43:09.300 --> 00:43:11.490 whether harm is more direct.

728 00:43:11.490 --> 00:43:15.560 In the case of climate, arguably EU, the US, and China

729 00:43:15.560 --> 00:43:20.500 would want to of kind of arrangement where they share

730 00:43:20.500 --> 00:43:22.760 the obligation to take in refugees and so that

731 00:43:22.760 --> 00:43:24.940 they would want that to happen only under the grounds

732 00:43:24.940 --> 00:43:27.823 of some kind of international cooperation.

733 00:43:28.810 --> 00:43:31.050 Do you see the discussions moving in that direction?

734 00:43:31.050 --> 00:43:33.830 It's an easy way to pass the buck, as you said,

735 00:43:33.830 --> 00:43:36.200 but it is the case that the harm is much more distributed

736 00:43:36.200 --> 00:43:39.670 in the case of climate and how do we deal with that?

737 00:43:39.670 --> 00:43:42.040 Thanks. <v ->Thanks two excellent</v>

738 00:43:42.040 --> 00:43:45.090 really important and challenging questions.

739 00:43:45.090 --> 00:43:48.940 So I think you're absolutely right with regard

740 00:43:48.940 --> 00:43:52.670 to the second point as we've seen

741 00:43:52.670 --> 00:43:55.970 in our recent international climate agreements,

742 00:43:55.970 --> 00:44:00.740 our global major producers of greenhouse gases

743 00:44:00.740 --> 00:44:04.970 have been hesitant to participate and engage

744 00:44:04.970 --> 00:44:09.110 unless they know that their partners are also participating.

745 00:44:09.110 --> 00:44:14.110 So I think that in our future international meetings,

746 00:44:14.480 --> 00:44:18.310 we need to have further discussion of how all the agents

747 00:44:18.310 --> 00:44:23.310 are going to play some role in responsibility

748 00:44:23.570 --> 00:44:25.430 for addressing both of the points that you raised.

749 00:44:25.430 --> 00:44:29.550 One, welcoming individuals, but also on the other hand,

750 00:44:29.550 --> 00:44:33.230 helping nations that are having internal displacement

751 00:44:33.230 --> 00:44:37.053 to accommodate populations that are displaced.

752 00:44:38.550 --> 00:44:40.810 And of course, places like Bangladesh

753 00:44:40.810 --> 00:44:45.740 are going to be considerably losing land area

754 00:44:45.740 --> 00:44:47.460 to the rising sea levels as well.

755 00:44:47.460 --> 00:44:51.650 So we can anticipate pretty significant movement

756 00:44:51.650 --> 00:44:54.610 of populations that are going to need

757 00:44:54.610 --> 00:44:56.563 a multinational response.

758 00:44:58.500 --> 00:45:00.620 But I think you're absolutely right that there needs

759 00:45:00.620 --> 00:45:05.620 to be a geopolitical conversation in which

760 00:45:05.750 --> 00:45:10.750 there's a shared sense of responsibility being taken

761 00:45:11.340 --> 00:45:15.880 so that we're all doing our part just as we have

762 00:45:15.880 --> 00:45:20.770 with any moderately successful international agreement

763 00:45:20.770 --> 00:45:24.470 in the past, a sort of quid pro quo

764 00:45:24.470 --> 00:45:28.743 is a bit of an ethical understanding as well.

765 00:45:30.580 --> 00:45:32.380 <v Instructor>Thank you.</v> <v ->Thanks.</v>

766 00:45:38.916 --> 00:45:40.840 <v Instructor>Laura, I had one more point</v>

767 00:45:40.840 --> 00:45:42.360 that I wanted to raise.

768 00:45:42.360 --> 00:45:45.780 Which I think builds maybe on something that Nara Sumat

769 00:45:45.780 --> 00:45:48.943 was talking about, which is prevention.

770 00:45:50.180 --> 00:45:54.023 because as you know, when people migrate,

771 00:45:56.600 --> 00:45:59.850 it's very stressful, people lose their homes

772 00:45:59.850 --> 00:46:01.110 and their way of life.

773 00:46:01.110 --> 00:46:04.340 So even with the support of being taken in

774 00:46:04.340 --> 00:46:08.350 by another country or internally, that's insufficient

775 00:46:12.230 --> 00:46:13.620 in many ways.

776 00:46:13.620 --> 00:46:16.120 That it would be much better for people if they didn't have

777 00:46:16.120 --> 00:46:18.113 to migrate in the first place.

778 00:46:19.090 --> 00:46:23.870 So, I think that would involve support

779 00:46:25.010 --> 00:46:29.250 by the high emitting countries

780 00:46:29.250 --> 00:46:34.250 to the lower emitting countries whereas you pointed out

781 00:46:34.400 --> 00:46:36.320 the migration is mainly taking place

782 00:46:38.350 --> 00:46:41.120 for stronger climate change adaptation measures

783 00:46:41.120 --> 00:46:45.940 that would help keep people where they live

784 00:46:45.940 --> 00:46:49.763 and protecting them from effects of climate change.

785 00:46:52.960 --> 00:46:54.010 <v ->I completely agree.</v>

786 00:46:54.010 --> 00:46:57.170 I think there's such a broad literature

787 00:46:57.170 --> 00:47:02.170 on the mental health sequela of disaster response

788 00:47:02.210 --> 00:47:05.990 and particularly in scenarios where there's not

789 00:47:05.990 --> 00:47:09.800 as strong infrastructure for rebuilding

790 00:47:09.800 --> 00:47:14.740 and or accommodating right in scenarios

791 00:47:14.740 --> 00:47:16.993 where it's possible to accommodate.

792 00:47:17.890 --> 00:47:21.861 There are all sorts of cultural benefits

793 00:47:21.861 --> 00:47:26.861 of allowing individuals to remain intact social units.

794 00:47:27.930 --> 00:47:32.930 There's a huge mental and social disruption that occurs

795 00:47:33.190 --> 00:47:38.190 when families are separated and communities are split up

796 00:47:38.570 --> 00:47:41.323 and social networks are disrupted.

797 00:47:42.790 --> 00:47:45.860 We saw as a sort of parallel history here

798 00:47:45.860 --> 00:47:48.010 in the United States with a history

799 00:47:48.010 --> 00:47:52.080 of Native American populations being moved to reservations

800 00:47:52.080 --> 00:47:55.080 and then in the 1950s and 1960s,

801 00:47:55.080 --> 00:47:59.210 those reservations being incrementally reduced

802 00:47:59.210 --> 00:48:02.520 and those populations urbanized at the expense

803 00:48:02.520 --> 00:48:05.870 of social networks that were health sustaining

804 00:48:05.870 --> 00:48:07.300 and health promoting.

805 00:48:07.300 --> 00:48:11.820 And we've seen significant literature now linking

806 00:48:11.820 --> 00:48:16.803 that history to ongoing health problems.

807 00:48:18.100 --> 00:48:22.060 So that's just one scenario I think of a case where

808 00:48:22.060 --> 00:48:26.790 there's an argument to be made for supporting communities

809 00:48:26.790 --> 00:48:30.790 to thrive wherever possible,

810 00:48:30.790 --> 00:48:33.520 whenever possible as an approach as well.

811 00:48:33.520 --> 00:48:38.520 And then at the same time, adapting and being realistic

812 00:48:39.250 --> 00:48:44.000 about the movement needs of populations

813 00:48:44.000 --> 00:48:49.000 that are not going to be able to sustain themselves

814 00:48:49.243 --> 00:48:51.713 in each shifting environments.

815 00:48:54.871 --> 00:48:55.933 And the question is,

816 00:48:57.510 --> 00:48:59.560 what do you see as the role of contributions

817 00:48:59.560 --> 00:49:04.190 that academic community can make about climate refugees?

818 00:49:04.190 --> 00:49:09.047 So I think this is a great question to end on because

819 00:49:10.460 --> 00:49:13.180 there's been some discussion on is here

820 00:49:13.180 --> 00:49:14.570 at our own institution

821 00:49:15.790 --> 00:49:19.870 about accommodating displaced academics.

822 00:49:19.870 --> 00:49:24.563 And I think that there's a real responsibility,

823 00:49:25.730 --> 00:49:28.270 particularly for those of us who have the privilege

824 00:49:28.270 --> 00:49:32.380 of having these conversations and taking the time

825 00:49:32.380 --> 00:49:37.380 to research and think about the implications of the shifts

826 00:49:40.390 --> 00:49:42.983 that we're seeing at an international level,

827 00:49:45.030 --> 00:49:46.723 is a sort of virtue ethics.

828 00:49:48.030 --> 00:49:50.730 We talk about ethics at the political sphere
829 00:49:50.730 --> 00:49:53.713 and then we talk about ethics at an individual
level.
830 00:49:54.630 --> 00:49:57.940 The classic or sense of virtue ethics,
831 00:49:57.940 --> 00:50:01.140 what are my individual character traits that
I'm going
832 00:50:01.140 --> 00:50:05.800 to cultivate to live an ethically responsible life
833 00:50:05.800 --> 00:50:10.610 and living as members of an institution such
as this that
834 00:50:10.610 --> 00:50:12.880 could really stand to benefit from
835 00:50:14.510 --> 00:50:19.100 and does benefit already from a very diverse
836 00:50:19.100 --> 00:50:23.308 and inclusive international faculty base.
837 00:50:23.308 --> 00:50:28.308 There's so much that we can learn from indi-
viduals who need
838 00:50:29.230 --> 00:50:30.690 a new place to be.
839 00:50:30.690 --> 00:50:35.600 And so I think that that's a great point that
an institution
840 00:50:36.560 --> 00:50:41.560 has an ethical obligation to think about how
841 00:50:41.790 --> 00:50:46.010 we can be a part of a solution to the problem
842 00:50:46.010 --> 00:50:51.010 that we are also a part of a system that creates.
843 00:50:52.020 --> 00:50:55.580 We can't of course solve all of these problems
844 00:50:55.580 --> 00:50:58.370 as an institution, but we're not neutral.
845 00:50:58.370 --> 00:51:01.660 We don't exist in a vacuum,
846 00:51:01.660 --> 00:51:06.040 we're not separate from all of this discussion.
847 00:51:06.040 --> 00:51:11.040 We are a major employer and so we do have
an opportunity
848 00:51:11.590 --> 00:51:16.590 to provide employment and interactions and
engagement
849 00:51:18.991 --> 00:51:23.820 and collaborative opportunities with individ-
uals
850 00:51:23.820 --> 00:51:28.820 who can really help to enrich our learning
851 00:51:29.490 --> 00:51:34.490 and also have some sort of compensation for
the problems

852 00:51:36.790 --> 00:51:40.783 that societies such as the state community have created.

853 00:51:45.140 --> 00:51:46.168 <v Instructor>Well, thanks Laura</v>

854 00:51:46.168 --> 00:51:49.740 for an excellent presentation

855 00:51:49.740 --> 00:51:52.500 and for bringing up all of these important issues

856 00:51:52.500 --> 00:51:54.393 that we'll have to keep working on.

857 00:51:55.453 --> 00:51:57.153 <v ->Thank you, it's such a pleasure.</v>

858 00:51:58.450 --> 00:52:00.230 <v Instructor>Bye everyone.</v> <v ->Bye.</v>